



**Appendix J**  
MCA Table

Dublin Road/  
Shanganagh Road/  
Corbawn Lane  
Junction Options

MCA Dublin Road/ Shanganagh Road/ Corbawn Lane Junction Options

Assessment Criteria	Assessment Sub-Criteria	EPR Option Fully signalised junction and closure of Corbawn Lane	Option 1 Fully signalised junction, Entry/Exit to and from Corbawn Lane	Option 2 Fully signalised junction, Entry/Exit to Corbawn Lane with Restrictions	Option 3 Fully signalised junction, Entry only to Corbawn Lane	Option 4 Fully signalised junction, Exit only from Corbawn Lane to Shanganagh Road.	Option 5 Roundabout	
Economy	1.a. Capital Cost	Requires widening to provide for traffic lanes. Requires widening of the existing old railway bridge and cycle ramp connection	Requires widening to provide for traffic lanes. Requires widening of the existing old railway bridge	Requires widening to provide for traffic lanes. Requires widening of the existing old railway bridge	Requires widening to provide for traffic lanes. Requires widening of the existing old railway bridge	Some kerb realignment and associated drainage works, urban realm and repaving old railway bridge	Retain as existing, no major road works	
	Rank							
	1.b. Transport Reliability and Quality	Dedicated bus lanes in both directions along the Dublin Road. Cycle track connection not provided at the junction. At point where bus lane is shared with cyclists, bus speeds will be restricted by slowest cyclist in the shared lane, hence this scores lower	Dedicated bus lanes in both directions along the Dublin Road. Cycle track connection not provided at the junction. At point where bus lane is shared with cyclists, bus speeds will be restricted by slowest cyclist in the shared lane, hence this scores lower	Dedicated bus lanes in both directions along Dublin Road. Two way cycle track connection provided at the main junction only. At point where bus lane is shared with cyclists, bus speeds will be restricted by slowest cyclist in the shared lane, hence this scores lower	Dedicated bus lanes in both directions along Dublin Road. Two way cycle track connection provided at the main junction only. At point where bus lane is shared with cyclists, bus speeds will be restricted by slowest cyclist in the shared lane, hence this scores lower	Dedicated bus lanes in both directions along Dublin Road. Two way cycle track connection provided at the main junction only. At point where bus lane is shared with cyclists, bus speeds will be restricted by slowest cyclist in the shared lane, hence this scores lower	SB Bus Lane provided but NB bus lane removed, however signal control bus priority provided. Two way cycle track connection provided at the main junction only. 30kph speed limit has been introduced in this section of shared traffic. At point cyclists share bus lane and general traffic lane, bus speeds will be restricted by slowest cyclist in the shared lane, hence this scores lower	Roundabout does not provide for bus priority and there will be delays to buses
Rank								
Integration	2.a. Land Use Integration	Maintains existing land use characteristics.	Maintains existing land use characteristics.	Maintains existing land use characteristics.	Maintains existing land use characteristics.	Maintains existing land use characteristics.	Maintains existing land use characteristics.	
	Rank							
	2.b. Residential Population and Employment Catchments	All scheme options use the same bus stops, hence the residential and employment catchments are the same.	All scheme options use the same bus stops, hence the residential and employment catchments are the same.	All scheme options use the same bus stops, hence the residential and employment catchments are the same.	All scheme options use the same bus stops, hence the residential and employment catchments are the same.	All scheme options use the same bus stops, hence the residential and employment catchments are the same.	All scheme options use the same bus stops, hence the residential and employment catchments are the same.	All scheme options use the same bus stops, hence the residential and employment catchments are the same.
	Rank							
	2.c. Transport Network Integration	Overall integrates well with the transport network plan, for bus priority and cyclists	Does not integrate fully with transport network plan, especially for cyclists	Overall integrates well with the transport network plan, for bus priority and cyclists	Overall integrates well with the transport network plan, for bus priority and cyclists	Overall integrates well with the transport network plan, for bus priority and cyclists	Overall integrates well with the transport network plan, for bus priority and cyclists	Roundabout does not integrate with the transport network plan and strategies
	Rank							
2.d. Cycle Network Integration	GDA Cycle Network identifies Dublin Road as Secondary Route till the Corbawn Lane and then Primary Route going southbound towards Shankill This option proposes 2-way cycle track along the Dublin Road, north of Shanganagh Road and then southwards cyclists share general traffic lane. However, cycle connections are not provided at the junction	GDA Cycle Network identifies Dublin Road as Secondary Route till the Corbawn Lane and then Primary Route going southbound towards Shankill This scheme option proposes a shared bus and cycle lane in both directions so scores lower than other Scheme Options.	GDA Cycle Network identifies Dublin Road as Secondary Route till the Corbawn Lane and then Primary Route going southbound towards Shankill This scheme option proposes a shared bus and cycle lane in both directions so scores lower than other Scheme Options. Two-way cycle track is provided along the Dublin Road to connect Stonebridge Road with Shanganagh Road and Corbawn Lane as that's the major desire line for cyclists especially School students. Two way cycle track connection provided at the junction.	GDA Cycle Network identifies Dublin Road as Secondary Route till the Corbawn Lane and then Primary Route going southbound towards Shankill This scheme option proposes a shared bus and cycle lane in both directions so scores lower than other Scheme Options. Two-way cycle track is provided along the Dublin Road to connect Stonebridge Road with Shanganagh Road and Corbawn Lane as that's the major desire line for cyclists especially School students. Two way cycle track connection provided at the junction.	GDA Cycle Network identifies Dublin Road as Secondary Route till the Corbawn Lane and then Primary Route going southbound towards Shankill This scheme option proposes a shared bus and cycle lane in both directions so scores lower than other Scheme Options. Two-way cycle track is provided along the Dublin Road to connect Stonebridge Road with Shanganagh Road and Corbawn Lane as that's the major desire line for cyclists especially School students. Two way cycle track connection provided at the junction.	GDA Cycle Network identifies Dublin Road as Secondary Route till the Corbawn Lane and then Primary Route going southbound towards Shankill This scheme option proposes a shared bus and cycle lane in both directions so scores lower than other Scheme Options. Two-way cycle track is provided along the Dublin Road to connect Stonebridge Road with Shanganagh Road and Corbawn Lane as that's the major desire line for cyclists especially School students. Two way cycle track connection provided at the junction.	Does not provide for bus priority, ability to adjust to heavier traffic flows at certain times of the day, better journey time reliability, co-ordination between junctions and safe infrastructure for pedestrian and cyclists and hence does not meet the BusConnects objectives.	
Rank								
Accessibility & Social Inclusion	2.e. Traffic Network Integration	The EPR Option would require a large intervention to provide sufficient junction capacity and widening to provide more lanes on the approaches to the junction and therefore would have significant negative impact in terms of capital cost and the integration of the junction to its local surroundings. This option does not provide for local trips to or from Corbawn Lane from Shanganagh Road / Dublin Road and will result in increased traffic queuing on the Shanganagh Road and Beechfield Manor. This option does not provide for overall junction functionality in all directions and did not receive a favourable response from the local residents of Shankill during the non-statutory consultation.	This option does provide for overall junction movements in all directions. However, a fully signalised junction would require a large intervention to provide sufficient junction capacity and widening to provide more lanes on approaches to junction would have significant negative impact. Keeping the same road configuration on approach does not give enough capacity for the junction to operate efficiently. This option creates cyclists conflict movement at the junction. This option limits the urban realm opportunities due to the widening required to accommodate additional lanes. The shorter section of northbound bus lane does not provide significant benefits to bus movements, as buses may often be prevented from accessing the lane by general traffic queuing.	This option allows for local trips but no access from Corbawn Lane to Dublin Road towards Loughlinstown Roundabout. This option does not allow right turn into Corbawn Lane from Shankill village. Junction modelling demonstrates that this option requires Corbawn Lane to be restricted to allow the junction to operate as efficiently as possible. A large intervention will be required to achieve required design standards for road safety and widening on approaches to junction would have a significant negative impact. Keeping the same road configuration on approach does not provide enough capacity for the junction to operate. This option creates cyclists conflict movement at the junction due to the northbound left turn slip lanes. This option does not provide for overall junction functionality in all directions.	This option provides more capacity for traffic movements along Shanganagh Road and reduces the volume of traffic turning right into Beechfield Manor. However, it adds traffic exiting Beechfield Manor as a result of the one-way operation of Corbawn Lane. This option would require a large intervention to provide sufficient capacity and widening to provide more lanes on approaches to junction would have significant negative impact. This option is not considered resilient enough to accommodate the Dublin Road traffic flows (as the 'mainline' is now on Shanganagh Road) with less queuing space on Shanganagh Road and potential impact on Beechfield Manor junction. This option creates cyclists conflict movement at the junction and on Dublin Road due to the northbound left turn slip lanes.	This option provides more flexibility for local trips from Corbawn Lane but Beechfield Manor remains the primary route. A dedicated right-turn lane is proposed from Shanganagh Road onto Beechfield Manor to cater for the additional traffic routed through Beechfield Manor. Junction modelling of this option demonstrates sufficient junction capacity and provides for sufficient junction resilience for traffic flows in all directions, in particular Dublin Road, and any flow fluctuations. Although the northbound bus lane is removed in this option compared to EPR Option, Option 1, 2 and 3; bus priority is achieved in both directions (northbound and southbound) through signal control priority, bus detection and overall improved junction functionality. This option provides better interface for cyclists and pedestrians at the junction, with improved cyclist transition on Corbawn Lane following public consultation feedback. Urban realm opportunities are enhanced for this option. This option also provides to serve for Garda emergency service from the Garda Station on Dorney Court.	This option retains the existing roundabout and does not provide for bus lanes and cycle track connection, or signalised pedestrian crossing facilities. A roundabout of this size does not provide for bus priority and lacks the benefit of traffic signals which can adjust to heavier traffic flows at certain times of the day, generating better journey time reliability, co-ordination between junctions and safe infrastructure for pedestrian and cyclists and hence does not meet the BusConnects objectives. A signalised roundabout could not be accommodated within the footprint of the junction due to the small inscribed circle diameter (ICD) of the roundabout preventing the placement of traffic signals with sufficient visibility or stacking capacity within the roundabout. The signalised junction is more sustainable solution to serve the needs of all road users and has the ability to respond to evolving traffic issues without major interventions and better co-ordination between adjacent signalised junction.	
	Rank							
	3.a. Key Trip Attractors (Education/Health/Commercial/Employment)	All options follow the same route and hence, serve the same trip attractors.	All options follow the same route and hence, serve the same trip attractors.	All options follow the same route and hence, serve the same trip attractors.	All options follow the same route and hence, serve the same trip attractors.	All options follow the same route and hence, serve the same trip attractors.	All options follow the same route and hence, serve the same trip attractors.	All options follow the same route and hence, serve the same trip attractors.
Rank								
3.b. Deprived Geographic Areas	All options primarily serve an area considered affluent in the Pobal Deprivation Index.	All options primarily serve an area considered affluent in the Pobal Deprivation Index.	All options primarily serve an area considered affluent in the Pobal Deprivation Index.	All options primarily serve an area considered affluent in the Pobal Deprivation Index.	All options primarily serve an area considered affluent in the Pobal Deprivation Index.	All options primarily serve an area considered affluent in the Pobal Deprivation Index.	All options primarily serve an area considered affluent in the Pobal Deprivation Index.	
Rank								
Safety	4.a. Road Safety	This option proposes 2-way cycle track along the Dublin Road, north of Shanganagh Road and then southwards cyclists share general traffic lane. However, cycle connections are not provided at the junction. This option creates cyclists conflict movement at the junction.	This option creates cyclists conflict movement at the junction.	This option creates cyclists conflict movement at the junction. Geometry causes road safety audit issues unless significant widening introduced	This option creates cyclists conflict movement at the junction.	This option provides better interface for cyclists and pedestrians at the junction, with improved cyclists transition on Corbawn Lane. 30kph speed limit has been introduced in this section of mixed traffic improves safety for all road users	Roundabout does not provide for bus priority and safe infrastructure for pedestrian and cyclists and hence does not meet the BusConnects objectives.	
	Rank							
Environment	5.a. Archaeology and Cultural Heritage	No appreciable impacts	No appreciable impacts	No appreciable impacts	No appreciable impacts	No appreciable impacts	No appreciable impacts	
	Rank							
	5.b. Architectural Heritage	This option impact the heritage wall along this section	This option impact the heritage wall along this section	This option impact the heritage wall along this section	This option impact the heritage wall along this section	No major impacts noted	No appreciable impacts	
	Rank							
	5.c. Flora & Fauna	No appreciable impacts	No appreciable impacts	No appreciable impacts	No appreciable impacts	No appreciable impacts	No appreciable impacts	
	Rank							
	5.d. Soils and Geology	No appreciable impacts	No appreciable impacts	No appreciable impacts	No appreciable impacts	No appreciable impacts	No appreciable impacts	
	Rank							
	5.e. Hydrology	No appreciable impacts	No appreciable impacts	No appreciable impacts	No appreciable impacts	No appreciable impacts	No appreciable impacts	
	Rank							
	5.f. Landscape and Visual	Change to the Corbawn Roundabout is significant and less opportunity to enhance public realm	Change to the Corbawn Roundabout environment	Change to the Corbawn Roundabout environment	Change to the Corbawn Roundabout environment	Change to the Corbawn Roundabout environment, however, significant opportunity to enhance public realm	Maintains existing streetscape of Shankill Village and Corbawn Lane Environment	
	Rank							
	5.g. Air Quality	There is expected to be minimal change in air quality in comparing these options. Impacts may occur from construction.	There is expected to be minimal change in air quality in comparing these options. Impacts may occur during construction.	There is expected to be minimal change in air quality in comparing these options. Impacts may occur during construction.	There is expected to be minimal change in air quality in comparing these options. Impacts may occur during construction.	There is expected to be minimal change in air quality in comparing these options. Impacts may occur during construction.	There is expected to be minimal change in air quality in comparing these options. Impacts may occur during construction.	
Rank								
5.h. Noise and Vibration	There is expected to be minimal change in noise and vibration due to increased bus load. Short term impacts may occur from construction.	There is expected to be minimal change in noise and vibration due to increased bus load. Short term impacts may occur from construction.	There is expected to be minimal change in noise and vibration due to increased bus load. Short term impacts may occur from construction.	There is expected to be minimal change in noise and vibration due to increased bus load. Short term impacts may occur from construction.	There is expected to be minimal change in noise and vibration due to increased bus load. Short term impacts may occur from construction.	There is expected to be minimal change in noise and vibration due to increased bus load. Short term impacts may occur from construction.		
Rank								
5.i. Land Use Character	This option provides for fully signalised junction with bus lanes in both direction and a wider footprint. This requires widening of the existing old Railway Bridge and heritage wall which is a significant impact. This option requires more landtake compared to other options.	This option provides for fully signalised junction with bus lanes in both direction and a wider footprint. This requires widening of the existing old Railway Bridge and heritage wall which is a significant impact	This option provides for fully signalised junction with bus lanes in both direction and a wider footprint. This requires widening of the existing old Railway Bridge and heritage wall which is a significant impact	This option provides for fully signalised junction with bus lanes in both direction and a wider footprint. This requires widening of the existing old Railway Bridge and heritage wall which is a significant impact	This option provides for fully signalised junction with bus lanes in Southbound direction only. NB bus lane is removed and the junction footprint does not impact the Old Railway bridge	No appreciable impacts		
Rank								